

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

<b>Louis Agre <i>et al.</i>,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Plaintiffs,</b>	:	<b>Civil Action No. 2:17-cv-4392</b>
	:	
<b>v.</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Thomas W. Wolf <i>et al.</i>,</b>	:	
	:	
<b>Defendants.</b>	:	

**LEGISLATIVE DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR JUDGMENT  
PURSUANT TO RULE 50 OR RULE 52(c)**

Legislative Defendants, Michael C. Turzai, in his official capacity as Speaker of the Pennsylvania House of Representatives, and Joseph B. Scarnati, III, in his official capacity as Pennsylvania Senate President Pro Tempore (collectively, "Legislative Defendants"), file this Motion for Judgment pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 50 or, alternatively, 52(c). In support of their motion, Legislative Defendants rely upon their Memorandum of Law filed herewith.

Dated: December 6, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

**BLANK ROME LLP**

**CIPRIANI & WERNER, P.C.**

/s/ Brian S. Paszamant  
BRIAN S. PASZAMANT  
JASON A. SNYDERMAN  
JOHN P. WIXTED  
One Logan Square  
130 N. 18<sup>th</sup> Street  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103  
Phone: 215-569-5791  
Email: [paszamant@blankrome.com](mailto:paszamant@blankrome.com)  
[snyderman@blankrome.com](mailto:snyderman@blankrome.com)  
[jwixed@blankrome.com](mailto:jwixed@blankrome.com)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendant  
Senator Joseph Scarnati III*

/s/ Kathleen A. Gallagher  
KATHLEEN A. GALLAGHER  
CAROLYN BATZ MCGEE  
650 Washington Road, Suite 700  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15228  
Phone: 412-563-4978  
Email: [kgallagher@c-wlaw.com](mailto:kgallagher@c-wlaw.com)  
[cmcgee@c-wlaw.com](mailto:cmcgee@c-wlaw.com)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendant  
Representative Michael Turzai*

**HOLTZMAN VOGEL JOSEFIAK  
TORCHINSKY PLLC**

*/s/ Jason Torchinsky*

---

JASON TORCHINSKY (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
SHAWN SHEEHY (admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
45 North Hill Drive, Suite 100  
Warrenton, Virginia 20186  
Phone: 540-341-8808  
Facsimile: 540-341-8809  
Email: [jtorchinsky@hvjt.law](mailto:jtorchinsky@hvjt.law)  
[ssheehy@hvjt.law](mailto:ssheehy@hvjt.law)

*Attorneys for Legislative Defendants  
Senator Joseph Scarnati III and  
Representative Michael Turzai*

**BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP**

*/s/ Patrick T. Lewis*

---

PATRICK T. LEWIS  
(admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
Key Tower  
127 Public Square  
Suite 2000  
Cleveland, Ohio 44144  
Phone: 216-621-0200  
Email: [plewis@bakerlaw.com](mailto:plewis@bakerlaw.com)

*Attorney for Legislative Defendant  
Representative Michael Turzai*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Kathleen A. Gallagher, hereby, certify that on this 6<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2017, I caused a true and correct copy of the foregoing ***LEGISLATIVE DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO RULE 50 OR RULE 52(c)*** to be served on all counsel of record, via the Court's ECF Filing System.

Respectfully submitted,

Dated: December 6, 2017

/s/ Kathleen A. Gallagher  
KATHLEEN A. GALLAGHER

**CIPRIANI & WERNER, P.C.**  
650 Washington Road, Suite 700  
Pittsburgh, PA 15228  
(412) 563-2500 (Telephone)  
(412) 563-2080 (Facsimile)